

Book Reviews

Holding China Together: Diversity and National Integration in the Post-Deng Era. Edited by BARRY J. NAUGHTON and DALI L. YANG.
[Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004. xi + 304 pp. £45.00.
ISBN 0-521-83730-8.]

This book is an excellent collection of essays that makes a major contribution to our understanding of contemporary China. Its unifying theme is to challenge the “China Deconstructs” or “Coming Collapse of China” paradigms that foresee the geographical disintegration and/or political collapse of China. The authors of this book put forward instead a more positive evaluation of China’s state capacities.

After a stimulating introduction by the editors, Part one deals with the mechanisms employed by the state to control the elite, and contains chapters by Cheng Li on regionalism among China’s elite, Zhiyue Bo on the nomenklatura system, Susan Whiting on township-level cadres, and Dali Yang on fiscal policies and structures. In Part two case studies of key policies throw light on the current situation of the Chinese state – by Dorothy Solinger on employment policy in the wake of the 1997 Asian Financial Crisis, Yanzhong Huang and Dali Yang on population control, Fubing Su on the restructuring of the coal industry and Barry Naughton on the Western Development Policy.

The quality of the individual chapters is very high and together they succeed in putting forward a coherent picture of a Chinese state which, while facing daunting problems, has nevertheless “succeeded in remaking institutions and reshaping policies in ways that enhance institutional integrity and strengthen national unity” (p. 6). There are a range of mechanisms through which central control and national unity are strengthened. Cadre control is one. The centre uses the nomenklatura system to limit the emergence of localism by transferring top provincial officials between provinces or between the provinces and the centre. At the township level, Whiting shows that the system of cadre control and incentives has strengthened central control even while leading to some undesirable results. Another of the book’s themes is increasing institutionalization, which is affecting the operation of the nomenklatura, and, according to Huang and Yang, changing the mechanisms of population control in a way that offers hope that the coercive aspects of that policy will decline.

The policy case studies also point to a number of ways the centre promotes its policy preferences. Shared objectives, according to Solinger’s simulating analysis, explain the broad similarities among the regional (Guangzhou, Wuhan and Shenyang) responses to contradictory government aims of strengthening labour markets while protecting the interests of urban workers. According to Su, forging an accommodation with local interests has allowed the central government to win support for its policy to restrict and cut back the township and village mines.

© The China Quarterly, 2005

Increased fiscal strength in the wake of the 1994 tax reforms has also strengthened the hand of the centre, allowing it, for example, to embark on the ambitious and redistributive Western Development Policy.

Predictions of China's collapse have certainly not gone away in the new millennium and not all will agree that the glass of China's state capacity is as half-full as the authors in this volume suggest. The authors show themselves well aware of the limitations of state power. For example, Naughton concludes that, although the state has made a conscious and partly successful attempt to avoid the pitfalls of previous programmes of regional redistribution, it is very unlikely that the Western Development Policy will lead to a reduction in regional differentials as between Western China and the coast. Beyond that, some of the authors perhaps take the claims of the Chinese state too much at face value – one example (p. 227) is the acceptance of the government's claim to have cut coal production by 250 million tons in 1999–2000, whereas many scholars in China now believe that output in fact continued at much the same level throughout. Officials were responding to incentives and instructions to cut production by reporting production cuts but not by actually implementing them.

There are some minor irritations with the book. Its long gestation period (it was first conceived in 1996) means that not all the chapters bring the story as much up to date as one might like. The book does not have a consistent referencing system and, where it uses a basically Harvard system, it does not list the references in the normal author date fashion.

Nevertheless, it would be totally wrong to end on a negative note. This is a first-class volume which makes an important contribution to Chinese Studies and to broader political science debates on state capacity. Many chapters will be used in courses on Chinese politics and scholars researching issues of state capacity will inevitably have to refer both to this book's overall conclusions and to the individual case studies.

TIM WRIGHT

New Confucianism: A Critical Examination. Edited by JOHN MAKEHAM.
[New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2003. 262 pp. ISBN 1-4039-6140-9.]

Readers of *New Confucianism* will note that the title of the book is not without irony, as the contributors variously question the existence of a definable intellectual tendency that could be named as such with any rigour, and even that Confucianism is the most important aspect of the thinking of some of the intellectuals associated with this tendency – including Xiong Shili (1885–1965), credited by many to be its founding figure. The irony in this case is welcome, as it serves to provoke interest in a vital current in twentieth century Chinese thought.

The volume undertakes two tasks. First is to subject “New Confucianism” to critical historical examination, which is performed admirably in the introductory essays by the editor, and the analysis by Song Xianlin of the Confucian revival in the PRC in the 1980s. At its narrowest, “New Confucianism” has been used to describe the work of a group of intellectuals, relocated in Hong Kong and Taiwan after 1949, who in 1958 published the “Declaration on Behalf of Chinese Culture Respectfully Announced to the World”: Mou Zongsan (1909–1995), Tang Junyi (1909–1978), Xu Fuguan (1903–1982), Zhang Junmai (1887–1969), plus the individual that Mou in particular viewed as the inspiration for the group, Xiong Shili. At its broadest, “New Confucianism” has included an even more diverse group of intellectuals, from Liang Shuming (1893–1988) and Feng Youlan (1895–1990), who stayed on in the PRC after 1949, to contemporary intellectuals such as Li Zehou and Tu Weiming. In either case, even the more narrowly defined group eschewed a self-description as “New Confucians.” Makeham argues that “New Confucianism” was an invention of the Confucian revival of the 1980s. The “label has exercised a homogenizing effect that has obscured complexities and philosophical differences at the expense of exploring the variety of forms in which Confucian-inspired philosophy has continued to survive throughout the twentieth century” (p. 43). In its claims to succession to the legacy Ming Confucianism (*daotong*, “the interconnecting thread of the way”), it has also had the effect of privileging one current in 20th-century Confucianism – and a conservative one, at that – over others. Makeham views the undertaking as a contemporary instance of “orthodoxy formation” (p. 4). It is no less important that New Confucians such as Mou Zongsan also identified their version of Confucianism with national cultural characteristics.

The other essays in the volume turn to close examination of the works of some of these intellectuals: Sylvia Chan on Li Zehou, Serina Chan on Mou Zongsan, Lauren Pfister on Feng Youlan, John Hanafin on Liang Shuming, and Ng Yu-kwan on Xiong Shili. These essays themselves are perhaps emblematic of the differences among the thinkers they discuss. The essays on Li Zehou and Mou Zongsan stand out for their willingness to define a core Confucian essence (or an essential Confucianism), accordance which serves as the basis for judging qualification for inclusion in “New Confucianism.” Thus Li Zehou, for all his Marxism, qualifies as a New Confucian because “his ethics and aesthetics are both concerned with inner sageliness” (p. 123). Likewise, Serina Chan, noting Mou’s “appropriation of Buddhist paradigms and Kantian terminologies,” writes nevertheless that, “despite its syncretic nature, his thought system is purely Confucian in terms of its content [his stress on *ren*, ‘empathetic compassion,’ as the central value]” (p. 147).

The remaining three essays adopt a more problematic approach to the issue of Confucianism. Pfister’s rather rambling essay makes a good case, nevertheless, for questioning Feng Youlan’s inclusion among the New Confucians, not least for the different *daotong* he established with Song Confucianism. More radically challenging are the essays by Hanafin

and Ng. Hanafin argues that both by his own insistence and the structure of his thinking, Liang Shuming is better viewed as a Buddhist than a Confucian. A similar argument is made by Ng, himself a disciple, concerning Xiong Shili's "Confucianism," which was "basically Buddhistic" in its methodology" (p. 241).

The essays in the volume are of high quality, and, considering the denseness of some of the metaphysical issues being discussed, quite accessible. The editor might have explained why the volume gives greater coverage to those whose inclusion among New Confucians is deemed to be dubious (Li Zehou, Feng Youlan and Liang Shuming), while it has no coverage of Tang Junyi, Xu Fuguan or Zhang Junmai, considered to be part of the "orthodox" group. The discussions of individual thinkers are more concerned with "categorizing" them than with the historical transformations their thinking represented, which is a weakness as it imprisons the volume within the very discourse it seeks to overcome.

This said, however, the volume brings together stimulating discussions that should provoke further interest in the unfolding (and invention) of "Confucian" legacies in the 20th century, their transformations within a changing intellectual and political context, and their deployment in struggles over the redefinition of the intellectual elite. These struggles were themselves fundamentally cultural – both in their relevance to the construction of national identity and in the necessity of articulating that identity to the challenge of competing universalisms.

ARIF DIRLIK

The Making of the State Enterprise System in Modern China. By MORRIS L. BIAN. [London: Harvard University Press, 2005. 331 pp. £29.95. ISBN 0-674-01717-X.]

This is a provocative book set to challenge our conventional beliefs about the origin of certain characteristics found in China's state enterprise system. Most scholars assume that the communist government had copied from the Soviet model; but M.L. Bian has extensively used Chinese archival materials to support the view that the Nationalist government of the Republican period (1911–1949) had already begun the socialization process in as early as the 1930s.

M.L. Bian simply but effectively asks "When, how and why did such an institutional pattern of state-owned enterprise take shape?" (p. 2). The author, seeking an explanation for the "endogenous" and "exogenous" origins of state enterprises and the *danwei* system, draws upon the insights of New Institutional Economics, in particular, the theory of institutional change as developed by Douglass C. North in his economic history of Europe and the United States.

The development of China's state enterprise system could be regarded as an institutional change: a policy change by the government to adopt

state intervention of the industrial sector. The book's underlying theme is that the crisis of the Sino-Japanese war had triggered this institutional change. The implementation of the state enterprise system was China's response to Japanese threats on national security following Japan's invasion of Manchuria in 1931 and subsequent attack on Shanghai in 1932.

There is coherence in the author's analysis of these aspects of the state enterprise system: (1) the governance structure of state enterprises, (2) the incentive mechanisms for management, (3) provision of social and welfare services for employees, (4) how the term "work unit" (*danwei*) came to be designated to state-owned enterprises and indeed to various levels of the administrative bureaucracy, and (5) the Nationalist government's ideology of a developmental state from which the state enterprise system was shaped. The author refers to speeches and writings of contemporary political leaders, especially those of Sun Yat-sen, to support the view that Nationalist leadership favoured the reconstruction of China by means of socialist economic planning to improve the livelihood of its people.

The process of institutional change to state ownership (when and how) in the book refers to only two manufacturing industries, the arsenals industry and the heavy industries (Chapters one and two). With regard to enterprise governance (Chapter three), the author argues that the war-triggered crisis of the 1930s and 1940s reinforced the use of the organizational model of formal administrative bureaucracy in state-run businesses. Thus, state enterprises were managed as "manufacturing bureaus" and by government officials.

The crisis of the Sino-Japanese war also led to the introduction of new management incentives (Chapter four). They included a new cost-accounting system to minimize production costs, but without great effect because state enterprises lacked the profit motive. Normative incentives in the form of "work emulation campaigns" were launched to improve productivity, as a shortage of workers and rampant inflation caused serious disruption of production. According to the author, it was the wartime destabilization of social and economic life that directly led to widespread provision of social and welfare services to employees, another defining characteristic of state enterprises (Chapter five). Company welfarism was seen to be necessary in many factories that were relocated from the coastal cities (e.g. Shanghai) to the interior provinces.

The most interesting is Chapter six which offers a convincing explanation that the "unit" (*danwei*) was a tool for improving and measuring efficiency in political, economic and administrative organizations. By 1945 *danwei* was used to refer to various levels of government and economic organizations. Its origin was attributed to American theories of public administration in the 1920s and 1930s. "Work unit" was used by Leonard D. White (political scientist) to describe the line of authority and responsibility within an organization. The *danwei* story in the book relates mainly to public administration as illustrated by the case of the Dadukou Iron and Steel Works in Chongqing. This enterprise undertook major reforms in the early 1940s but unsuccessfully tried to implement

the delegation of responsibility. Low-level managers, fearing to take up responsibility, would push a problematic matter to the intermediate level which often passed the matter to the upper level. However the high-level officials, not understanding the matter, would return it down to the lowest level.

This book is valuable to Chinese studies as knowledge is relatively sparse on enterprise management during the Republican period; there are a number of tables compiled from primary sources in the Appendix. Despite the devotion to New Institutional Economics in the Introduction, this book would be most useful to readers interested in public administration and politics; the abundant historical details would please many historians.

The fresh perspective is interesting – that the Nationalist leadership was inclined towards construction of a socialist economic system, ahead of the Communist government. However, Nationalist policy was the co-existence of state and private ownership so that light industries would be private-owned and heavy industries would be state-owned. Perhaps the author over-rates the socialization impact of the Republican period. It is the Communist government that has socialized both heavy and light industries since more than 40 years ago. Politicization of state enterprises by the CCP is unprecedented and overwhelming, so that even today its influence persists in the management of many state enterprises.

SUKHAN JACKSON

The Efficiency of China's Stock Market. By SHIGUANG MA. [Hampshire: Ashgate, 2004. xiv + 286 pp. £55.00. ISBN 0-7546-4241-0.]

As vast studies on the relationship between financial development and economic growth have well demonstrated, an efficient stock market is of great importance for the development of micro enterprises and hence the macro economy through financial resource mobilization, allocation, and utilization. While the stock market in China is still underdeveloped compared with those in developed economies, it has recently started to play an increasing role in China's economy. So there are growing concerns over the efficiency of China's stock market.

Using a comprehensive data set of China's listed companies between 1990 and 1998, this book aims to examine the efficiency of China's stock market by providing "a full and detailed picture of weak form efficiency, semi-strong form efficiency, and the seasonality" test results (p. 4). Empirical findings indicate the predictability of stock returns from random walk tests, regular return patterns from seasonality tests, and inefficient reflection of public information in the stock price from event studies. It is argued that the factors leading to the inefficient stock market in China include market segmentation, excessive government intervention, inadequate government regulation and poor corporate

governance in China's listed companies. Policy implications are considered based on the above factors to improve the efficiency of China's stock market.

The empirical analysis is the major contribution of this book, although the econometric techniques are not innovative. Its study of the difference between A and B shares, Shenzhen and Shanghai stock exchanges, and China and foreign markets clearly show both the complexity and uniqueness of China's stock market. Moreover, the use of various stock indexes and individual stock price information further explores all available efficiency evidence from different data sources.

There are, however, several possible improvements which could be made when discussing the topic even further. Firstly, due to the fact that the data only covers a period up to 1998 but the publishing year is 2004, the data appear to be slightly out of date. A quota system was adopted for initial public offerings (IPOs) before 2001, and an expert-review system replaced it after then. Thus, the question arises whether the efficiency of China's stock market has improved after the adoption of a more market-oriented IPO system. Secondly, the traditional tests used in this study have certain shortcomings which reduced its creditability. The runs test is suitable for the hypothesis of the independence of the signs of stock rates of return. But it is possible that stock rates of return are not independent in spite of the independence of their signs. Parametric tests are problematic when there are conditional heteroscedastic error terms in high-frequency data. The variance ratio test cannot identify the nonlinear deviation from efficient market hypotheses. So more advanced econometric methods, such as the generalized spectral derivative method, should be considered which is more general from a theoretical perspective and could avoid the above mentioned shortcomings of traditional tests. Thirdly, there may actually be additional factors explaining the inefficiency of China's stock markets which have not been acknowledged in this book. For example, both the low education level of individual investors and underdeveloped institutional investors may serve as explanations for these inefficiencies. Many individual stock market participants lack the ability to understand accounting and market information, and most of them follow the advice of so-called experts either shown on TV or in the newspapers. Those experts are often criticized for their collusion with some institutional investors to purposely mislead and hence make money from small investors. Moreover, both the size and number of institutional investors are very small in China, which hinders the competition among them and also reduce their incentive and ability to collect and analyse related information. Finally, there are some spelling errors in the book, for example, Congqing and Guandong in Figure 2.4 (p. 25). The correct names are Chongqing and Guangdong respectively.

To conclude, it can be stated that this book makes useful contributions to the ongoing debate on China's stock market efficiency although it may not be considered to be a theoretical breakthrough. Its comprehensive use of different variables and detailed analysis of various tests make it

required reading for those interested in market microstructure and the Chinese financial market.

TAO LI

High-Tech Industries in China. By CHIEN-HSUN CHEN and HUI-TZU SHIH.
[Cheltenham, UK and Northampton: Edward Elgar, 2005. 176 pp.
£45.00. ISBN 1-84542-199-X.]

The book has an eye-catching title and deals with the hot and increasingly important topic of China's becoming a technological powerhouse. Judging from its table of contents, the book is well-organized, as it starts with a discussion of China's high-tech development policy, then moves on to such topics as research and development (R&D) and innovation, regional disparities, multinational corporations' R&D efforts and commercialization of research results. In spite of these, *High-Tech Industries in China* is not a serious academic work but a collection of translated news reports about China's technological development, translated research done by Chinese scholars, and statistical tables without much analysis and interpretation.

High-tech industry, in the Chinese as well as the OECD context, includes five categories of manufacturing – medical and pharmaceutical products, aircraft and spacecraft, electronic and telecommunications equipment, computer and office equipments, and medical equipments and meters. But nowhere does the book discuss or even mention this definition. In fact, the book is not about high-tech industry by this definition.

The problem was probably due to the fact that Chen and Shih used the wrong data. What is unfortunate for them is that the Ministry of Science and Technology (MOST), which is their main source from statistics to secondary research, has since 2002 produced thick annual *China Statistical Yearbook on High-Technology Industry*. The biannual *China Science and Technology Indicators*, also published by MOST, devotes a chapter to high-tech industry. Instead of using such rich statistics which are more reliable, more systematic and better quality, the authors picked up sporadic information from MOST's website, newspapers and other sources, and, worse, carelessly treated it, resulting in the mismatch of the title and the content.

Despite all this, I still expected the first chapter, according to its heading, to describe the evolution of policies related to science and technology (S&T) development in China, such as the reform of the S&T system, the emphasis of enterprises as the centre of the national innovation system, the establishment of high-tech parks, the introduction of the venture capital mechanism, among others. But the book shifts its focus on productivity centres, incubators, research and industry collaboration, industry policy, regional policy, tax policy, and so on. These are relevant and important, but without knowing the background, readers would be puzzled as to why the Chinese government has formulated such policy measures and how these have been significant in the rise of

China's high-tech industry. Interestingly, Chapter two, on R&D and innovation in China's high-tech sector, starts with a discussion of the reform, which is supposed to have appeared in the previous chapter. Similarly, foreign direct investment, which has driven high-tech development for the past 20 years, has not been mentioned until the discussion of R&D activities by multinational corporations in Chapter four. The content of the section "Commercialization of Research Result Is Becoming More Efficient" has nothing to do with the topic.

What surprised me most is the sloppiness of the data presentation by the authors, two economists. For example, the book mentions patent applications in Beijing. According to the authors, the number for 1999 was more than 7,000, and that for 2001 was 4,969. The authors go on to say that "the total number of applications in the first half of 2003 was 7,885, representing a growth rate of 26.75 percent" (p. 76). I wonder first, how they came up with that 26.75 per cent; second, what that percentage increase means – over the same period of 2002 (but then why is the 2002 figure missing?); and third, how they interpret the decline from 1999 to 2001 (which is missing). There are cases like that throughout the book.

The authors have not utilized previous work on China's high-tech development by other scholars, particularly such book-length studies as Kathleen Walsh's *Foreign High-Tech R&D in China: Risks, Rewards, and Implications for U.S.-China Relations* (Washington, DC: Henry L. Stimson Center, 2003), Adam Sagel's *Digital Dragon: High-technology Enterprises in China* (New York and London: Cornell University Press, 2003), among others. Chen and Shih did not ignore this literature intentionally; they simply did not know it.

Given all these elements, I could only conclude that readers interested in high-tech industries in China will be disappointed by this book. This is a volume with the wrong title.

CONG CAO

Business as a Vocation. The Autobiography of Wu Ho-Su. By HUANG CHIN-SHING, translated, with an Introduction and Epilogue by HOYT CLEVELAND TILLMAN. [Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 2002. 262 pp. ISBN 0-88086-047-2.]

At the end of his life, Wu Ho-Su (Wu Huoshi), a key figure of the first generation of Taiwan industrialists, wanted to reflect the economic transitions of 20th-century Taiwan and his life and business activity. He looked for help from one of the most eminent historians in Taiwan, Dr Huang Chin-shing, Head of the History Section of the Institute of History and Philology of the Academia Sinica. Dr Huang drew on a series of interviews with Wu from December 1983 through November 1985 and went to considerable length to assess the information so provided, receiving access to records and people who could supplement Wu's

remembered stories. The result of this rare collaboration (whereas many other Taiwan industrialists' biographies have been written by journalists) was the publication of Wu Ho-Su's autobiography in Taipei in 1990 (*Ban shiji de fendou: Wu Huoshi xiansheng koushu zhuanjin*). A Japanese translation, *Taiwan no shishi* (Taiwan's Lion) was published in Tokyo in 1992. It is this text that has been translated into English by Hoyt Cleveland Tillman.

Wu was born in 1919 and died in 1986, at the age of 68. The son of a crippled former coolie from Hsinchu, he began as a labourer for a Japanese cloth-importing company in the 1930s, and eventually became a manager and then an independent entrepreneur. While American fire bombings were destroying many of the buildings in the cities of Taiwan during the last phase of the Second World War, he purchased a considerable number of properties from those escaping the bombings. Having worked diligently and invested boldly, he emerged at the end of the war as a middle-class merchant. When Taiwan was returned to China in 1945, Wu established the Shinkong (Xinguang) Company in Taipei. As a cloth merchant, Wu set his aspirations on the textile industry. In 1951, he established a dyeing and spinning factory in Hsinchu. Later he was a harbinger of Taiwan's man-made fibre industry. He then pioneered business ventures ranging from cloth and synthetic fibre industries to gas distribution, department stores and life insurance. By the 1980s, the Shinkong conglomerate was ranked as the sixth largest business group on the island; its power was symbolized by the fifty-storied Shinkong tower next to the Taipei railway station.

Wu's personal struggles and the story of Shinkong's expanding operations reflect Taiwan's trajectory of development from a largely agrarian society into one of the world's great economic forces. The importance of the Japanese legacy is one of the major facts that strike the reader. After graduating from elementary school, it was as an apprentice at a Japanese-owned cloth store that Wu studied business. Later he became the manager of another Japanese-owned company with a ten per-cent share of the profits, and this gave him the chance to make numerous purchasing trips to Japan. As an industrialist, Wu's main source of technologies (and venture partners) would still be Japan (notably the Mitsukoshi group). It is interesting to note that Wu's joint ventures with Japanese corporations suggest a complex relation of counterpoised collaborators, rather than Taiwan serving as the mere receptacle for outdated Japanese machinery.

Secondly, Wu's account sheds a different light on the relationship between the Nationalist state and the business community. Some scholars have highlighted the role of the Nationalist party-state in the economy while others have spoken of the state's role in terms of bureaucratic capitalism. Wu's account of several proposals and initiatives shows that it was sometimes the government meritocracy itself that needed to be prodded. Wu provides further evidence showing that the short-sightedness of government officials (like Yin Chung-jung in the 1950s) delayed some aspects of industrialization. Wu's stories confirm that Nationalist leaders had a bias towards fellow mainlanders and against local Tai-

wanese; so to become a textile industrialist, Wu had to resort to ruse (to secure the founding of China Artificial Fibre Company in 1954, he had to yield the chairmanship to a mainlander with close political ties with the government). Wu's perception of the government began to change only after Kwoh-ting Li (Li Guoding) took over the government management of economic affairs in 1963, and later with Chiang Ching-kuo's Taiwanization of the Nationalist Party.

Thirdly, Wu's autobiography is important as a means of understanding entrepreneurial practices and the business culture in Taiwan. In his account of handling business and making deals, Wu demonstrates how crucial relationship-based networks of influence (*guanxi*) are in conducting business. His stories vividly portray how Taiwanese negotiate business deals, make decisions and operate their enterprises. Wu's account is instructive on how he established his trustworthiness and relationships with not only his business associates, but also his employees. For instance, he initiated the practice of paying regular salaries to life insurance agents instead of them depending solely on commissions.

Finally, this volume questions the interplay between business practices and Confucian values. Even if the reader does not take at face value Wu's efforts to reconcile business life with principles inspired by Confucianism, the blend of Wu's business acumen and concern for Confucianism raises questions of the type that scholars have strenuously debated since Max Weber. Prof. Tillman explores these themes separately in the epilogue of the volume. To conclude, studying Wu's experiences and reflections might be particularly timely when Beijing authorities are increasingly acknowledging the fact that the future of China lies with private firms and simultaneously promoting the idea of "corporate responsibility."

GILLES GUIHEUX

The Party and the Arty in China: The New Politics of Culture. By RICHARD CURT KRAUS. [Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield, 2004. pp. xi, 247. \$27.95. ISBN: 0-7425-2720-4.]

In *The Party and the Arty in China: The New Politics of Culture*, Richard Curt Kraus analyses China's arts scene to explore the broader workings of the market, ideology, propaganda, censorship, and state-society relations in China. The book is valuable for both researchers and students because its in-depth research and creative analysis provide an engaging understanding of the often murky workings of the Chinese party-state as it engages in economic reform.

Art and politics have always been tightly interwoven in China, starting with Confucianism where rites and music were used to order the masses, and continuing with the Communist Party of China that seeks to "regulate the arts in order to secure a well-ordered citizenry" (pp. 10–11). Kraus first describes how the party-state swept away the pre-revolutionary

cultural institutions to set up a system of foundations to regulate art through patronage in the 1950s. While most academic analyses of Chinese art and literature focus on the political meanings of particular films or fiction, Kraus's book is valuable because he tells us how the institutions – the Ministry of Culture, the CCP Propaganda Department, the People's Liberation Army, etc. – work to both produce and censure political meaning.

With this background in mind, *The Party and the Arty* argues three interrelated themes to see how economic reforms have not only reshaped the art world, but have had a serious impact on political life in China: “First, the commercialization of China's cultural life has been intellectually liberating, but also poses serious challenges that artists are sometimes slow to master. Second, the shift from state patronage to a mixed system of private and public sponsorship is a fundamental political change; those who argue that China has had only economic reform, but no accompanying political reform, have too limited a conception of politics. Third, Western recognition of the reformation of China's cultural life has been obscured by ignorance, ideological barriers, and foreign-policy rivalry” (p. vii). The book thus argues that political reform is not only progressing, but has developed as an unintended consequence of the liberalization and commercialization of the cultural sphere. Rather than framing political reform in terms of a democratization of state institutions, Kraus thus sees it in terms of how art is “altering the meaning of rule” (p. 226). Political reform is not just about democratic elections, but emerges through increased cultural, economic and political space.

After charting the decline of the party-state's domination of the arts, Kraus examines how regulations shape Chinese art in the interplay between three rule systems: internal aesthetic standards, external market standards and political standards. For example in Chapter three, “Normalizing Nudity,” Kraus uses the example of the rise of nude painting in the 1980s to show how rule systems produce the issues of pornography and censorship. More than addressing aesthetic judgements in the narrow sense, the nude painting controversy laid bare enduring problems in China's gender, ethnic and class relations. Although Chinese artists felt that their nude paintings were engaged in a progressive scientific struggle against a backward feudal mentality, many other political issues were hidden behind these nude images. While most of the painters are Han men, many of the paintings portrayed exotic non-Han people, and almost all (both Han and non-Han) were of nude women, especially attractive young women. Nudes were okay in sites of high culture for the elite, but when they appeared in mass publications they were censored as pornography. Hence, nudes have a number of meanings. From a professional artist's point of view, the normalization of nudity in China was a victory for progressive politics. But the form that these nudes take often reifies existing hierarchical power relations to the disadvantage of women, non-Han ethnic groups and the poor. The curious example of nude painting thus lays bare the structures and processes of power in China.

The last chapter, “The hands that feed them,” relates China’s cultural and political reform to broader issues of party hegemony, nationalism and democracy. Although increased cultural space has led to increased political space, Kraus is not expecting liberal democratic institutions to emerge in China any time soon. But he is hopeful that an aesthetic view of politics, where there is an “increased toleration for rival points of view” is developing in China not just with artists but among the citizenry at large (p. 232). Kraus concludes that many Western commentators are blinded from seeing these important political developments because they see China as an authoritarian state that is completely different from Western liberal democracies. He uses examples from aesthetic and political debates in the West, where art is also censored, to argue that China’s struggles over beauty and truth are not so different from those faced large industrializing nations such as Brazil, Mexico or India – or the West.

Kraus’s witty analysis of political structures and political meanings in the art world is both entertaining and edifying. He draws from his long experience of living and working in China – not just in Beijing and Shanghai, but also in Nanjing and Fujian – to show how the central government’s rules are applied (or not) in the provinces. Kraus’s scholarship is exemplary because he is able to give a critical view of China, while also engaging in a critical view of his own society. Students of Chinese culture, society and politics will learn much from *The Party and the Arty*, as will a broader readership who is interested in the culture-politics dynamic and institutional reform.

WILLIAM A. CALLAHAN

China’s Environment and the Challenge of Sustainable Development.

Edited by KIRSTEN A. DAY. [Armonk, NY and London: M. E. Sharpe, 2005. xxv + 293 pp. ISBN 0-7656-1471-5.]

As China continues to develop into a major economic powerhouse and embraces technical support from overseas, the literature on the downsides of its development path continues to proliferate. Most of the chapters in this contribution to that literature were produced for the China International Business Seminar at Columbia University during 2002–2003. As the title implies, the object of the book is to point out how Chinese society and the international community are trying to avert further environmental degradation – presumably through methods assigned generally to that political contradiction of terms: sustainable development. The essays in this book concentrate on policy, law and international relations, although the specifics of pollution control are also given considerable coverage. Much less text is devoted to the technical and scientific side or the specific forms of resource degradation. The slight space given to soil erosion, natural hazards and afforestation projects can be seen as one of the book’s weaknesses.

A notable exception to the relative lack of discussion on resource degradation is the succinct contribution by Wang Tao and Wu Wei on sandy desertification that provides a good summary of information largely found elsewhere. The table detailing various methods of desert rectification was new to me and quite useful since it rates the effectiveness of a wide range of sandy land control techniques.

After a summary introduction by Day and a straightforward overview chapter by Cynthia W. Cann, Michael C. Cann, and Gao Shangquan that efficiently, if uncritically, introduces the various environmental problems facing China, we delve into specific papers of differing quality on various aspects. Some of these are social analyses. For example, Yok-Shiu F. Lee gives a thorough review of surveys about public attitudes towards the environment from 1990 to 2002. The surveys show considerable variety in their conclusions but suggest that people are not willing to see a large commitment of funds to environmental protection. The surveys suggest that Chinese often do not feel their environment is threatened – especially the rural populace who are often unaware of even basic threats.

Elizabeth Economy writes a solid overview on the politics of the environment, noting enforcement capabilities are not keeping up with the development of environmental law. She makes several points that are important for the beginning reader: local leaders are the ones making the most changes in environmental policy; the State Environmental Protection Agency upgrade of 1998 gave environmental protection more status at the national level but also led to the loss of many national environmental protection posts; and Chinese-style NGOs are a relatively new development dating only from the mid-1990s.

Despite distracting jargon, Eric Zusman and Jennifer Turner take us through a useful account of bureaucratic development in China and the impact of the international community on policy making. They provide an assessment of the efforts of early donors: The World Bank is given credit for being supportive of China early in the 1990s although the Asian Development Bank and the Japanese took over from about 1995. The roles of foundations, particularly American ones, are discussed in detail. Air pollution is seen as the icebreaker problem for international involvement perhaps because it was directly affecting other countries. They also mention the rapid growth of international nature conservation efforts in the 1990s, although my understanding is that nature conservation was the icebreaker in the 1980s.

Some chapters try to present a lot of practical information. For example, Ferris and Zhang share their experience with environmental law practice detailing the considerable progress made in this area since 1990 but also noting the long road that China has ahead. After a review of the legal process, they answer frequently posed questions from business people about the Chinese legal system and the environment.

The chapter by Morgenstern, Abeygunawardena, Anderson, Bell, Krupnick and Schreifels on trading emissions to improve air quality is really a case study of SO₂ emission control in Taiyuan, including efforts to introduce the equipment necessary to make control possible. The

chapter suffers from the limitations of looking largely at one city in China and only at USA examples. Thus while the authors deal clearly and ably with Taiyuan, this focus hinders the readers' a full feeling for air pollution control problems and solutions.

In contrast Wang and Li's contribution on energy demand addresses the "all China" energy picture sector by sector. The authors wisely look more at Chinese energy consumption than many past studies that often concentrated on domestic production, no longer a reasonable way to look at China's energy structure. A key point they make is that oil is no longer available in sufficient quantities for China to make a coal-to-oil transition as occurred in Europe, the United States and Japan. They also stress the emerging problem of automobile ownership, although they feel there is still time to control the development of this form of transport.

Elsewhere, Dan Millison links hazardous waste management and cleaner production in one contribution. As these problems are relatively new and growing, I think it was a good choice to include such an essay. This is one of the few chapters in which we get a comparison of China's efforts with other countries'. Millison finds that China has not done very well in this area compared with neighbouring Asian countries.

The book ends without a concluding chapter – perhaps not a bad thing for a book with such divergent methods and subjects. Instead, we get a bibliographic essay by James D. Seymour. The essay does not try to cover all of the literature on the Chinese environment but takes a topic by topic approach to what has been written in English largely over the last seven or eight years on the Chinese environment. Topics range from traditional culture and the environment in China to the development of proto-NGOs with politics; this excellent essay shows the reader where to go for more detailed analysis of various topics.

RICHARD LOUIS EDMONDS

Labor Dispute Resolution in China: Implications for Labor Rights and Legal Reform. By VIRGINIA HARPER HO. [Berkeley, CA: Institute of East Asian Studies, University of California, 2003. viii + 270 pp. \$18.00. ISBN 1-55729-082-2.]

Labour disputes have become a thorny issue during China's transition to a market economy. To maintain industrial order, the Chinese government has gone to some effort to institutionalize labour dispute resolution through legislation and institutional building. Virginia Harper Ho's book represents the first systematic study of China's burgeoning labour dispute system. Relying mainly on documentary materials as well as limited interviews, Ho provides a detailed analysis of the background, foundation, evolution and role of this system. Dissatisfied with the current western scholarship on Chinese labour law that has primarily focused on a statutory analysis of the text of the regulations, Ho sets out in her book to examine how the system of labour dispute resolution has actually been

utilized in practice, to what extent labour rights are enforceable and what the resolution of labour disputes means to the rule of law in China. Rather than being based on any coherent theoretical framework, Ho's book is organized by addressing these important questions from a robust legal perspective.

Ho begins with a general description of the effect of China's socio-economic transformation on labour relations, which sets the stage for her investigation. She then examines the evolution of the labor dispute resolution process based on the PRC Regulations for the Handling of Enterprise Labour Disputes (HELDR), the Labour Law, and subsequent regulations. Labour dispute resolution in China is a three-stage process of mediation, arbitration, and litigation. In addition to providing a succinct description of each of these stages, Ho looks into "pre-process mechanisms," such as labour supervision, tripartism, and conciliation. These mechanisms, she convincingly argues, are particularly critical for preventing collective disputes, which are often perceived by the government as a threat to productivity and social order. But Ho is cautious when applying the term "tripartism" to China, emphasizing that since trade unions, the administrative departments responsible for overseeing enterprises, and the labour bureau are all subject to the government, a tripartite co-operation is "little more than a cosmetic formalization of the existing relationship between these official entities" (p. 53).

How labour dispute resolution has functioned and been implemented in practice is one of the main issues that Ho's book explores. Using multiple sources of data, including case compilations, press reports, official statistics and anecdotal evidence, Ho assesses the level of utilization of the formal dispute resolution system. She finds that enterprise forms have affected labour relations and hence the likelihood of labour disputes. Restructuring is the chief cause of most labour disputes in state-owned enterprises (SOEs), as it has led to massive layoffs, wage arrears, changes in the terms of labour contracts, and so forth. Nevertheless, as Ho points out, the successful resolution of labour disputes that arise during industrial restructuring is made particularly difficult due to the lack of legal provisions applicable to the disputed issues. Private, foreign investment, and rural collective enterprises, according to Ho, account for most of China's labour disputes, although their causes vary. There is also substantial regional variation in the incidence of labour disputes. Ho shows that the utilization of the formal labour dispute resolution process has been concentrated in the coastal provinces and municipalities. On the other hand, Ho emphasizes correctly that formal processes are only a small part of the groundswell of labour conflict (p. 92). An important characteristic of the current labour resistance in China is that workers' legal action intersects with collective protests and bureaucratic action (p. 89).

The book devotes a whole chapter to the enforceability of labour rights. China has made unprecedented progress in creating the institutional and legal framework for labour dispute resolution and in providing mechanisms for the enforcement of labour rights. The fact that labour dispute

resolution outcomes have been to an overwhelming degree in favour of workers is an indication that some mechanisms do work. Nevertheless, the question of labour rights still poses a serious challenge to China. The root of the problem, as Ho states at the very beginning of the book, is not the absence of laws or legal institutions, but the inadequate implementation and enforcement of existing legal protections (p. 1). Ho shows that there are substantial barriers to workers' access to the legal process. For example, it is common for suits filed by workers to be rejected by arbitrators, owing to a range of reasons, such as the rising volume of cases, the limited resources of labour arbitration staff, the poor legal training of most local arbitrators and the effect of local economic interests on arbitrators' neutrality (p. 152). The time limit for filing a labour claim also disadvantages workers. Furthermore, there are many practical barriers to bringing suit, such as arbitrator condescension, transportation costs, navigating the legal bureaucracy and the opportunity costs of pursuing litigation. One of the key barriers, however, as Ho argues, is the failure of trade unions to promote workers' interests. The official trade unions' dual role of at once being an instrument of state policy and the sole representative of workers has hampered their ability to advocate for workers in resolving workplace disputes (p. 159).

To her credit, Ho does not stop at merely discussing labour dispute resolution per se. Rather, she goes on to link it to China's broad efforts to introduce "rule of law" and discusses the influence that the success or failure of labour dispute resolution may have beyond the workplace or the courtroom. Ho identifies legal, institutional and ideological constraints on the rule of law, and points out that these constraints reflect the tensions inherent in the state's dual goals of maintaining control of labour relations through the dispute resolution process and creating a system suited to the needs of a diversified economy (p. 184).

Ho's book presents a very comprehensive survey of China's labour dispute resolution system. However, she does not fully achieve one of the important goals that she sets for the book – to show how labour dispute resolution takes place in actual practice. The lack of empirical cases prevents her from revealing the internal dynamics of labour dispute resolution, which can be understood only by a close examination of what is going on in and outside the legal process: how parties exactly deploy legal means; how the provisions of labour laws are interpreted and applied in a specific dispute; what factors beyond legal arguments influence dispute resolution, etc.. For example, Ho notes that the involvement of political actors severely limits adjudicator independence (p. 207), but how and in what way? Integrating more cases would definitely help general readers make better sense of China's system of labour dispute resolution. But overall, this is a well-written book, providing a helpful documentation and analysis of China's labour dispute resolution system. It would be very useful to both scholars and practitioners interested in China's labour relations and legal reform.

FENG CHEN

Made in China: Women Factory Workers in a Global Workplace. By PUN NGAI. [Durham and London. Duke University Press. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 2005. i-iv + 227 pp. ISBN 1-932643-18-4 (cloth); ISBN 1-932643-00-1 (paperback).]

This book is an important and refreshing contribution to the protruding topic of social class formations and class struggle in China. China's search for modernity has led the socialist state to opening up to global capitalism which has resulted in the formation of a new type of female industrial worker: the dormitory labourer. This new labour regime of young peasants from the interior of China is the topic of this book. Based on ethnographic fieldwork and observations during six months (1995-96) in a factory alongside young female workers (*dagongmei*), Pun Ngai sets out to analyse the formation of this new type of worker-subject.

This new labour regime of young migrant girls (and boys) is forming a new proletariat in contemporary Chinese society. Being an underprivileged class without any rights, these workers differ considerably from the workers of Mao's China. How these female workers come to develop and embody new subjectivities and identities in sharp contrast to Mao's workers (*gongren*) of former times is the focus of analysis in this book. In her analysis of the new configuration of a female worker-subject, the author is not returning to materialist Marxian class-analysis relating the worker primarily to production relations and processes of class struggle, but she is analysing the emerging of female worker identities in reaction to both production relations as well as social relations of consumption, family, culture and gender.

First Pun Ngai illustrates how the making and unmaking of a worker identity in contemporary China is subjected to both market, but particularly state forces. Deng Xiaoping's neo-liberal economic reforms and cancellation of the phenomenon of social class have exchanged Mao's emphasis on class struggle with a discourse on modernity and social diversity. Labour and population policies permit rural migration to urban areas to work, but workers cannot acquire any status as urbanites, nor can they enjoy the benefits of education, housing or other rights connected to urban citizenship. These political-administrative forces have thus produced a proletariat of transient (three-five years) labourers, especially female workers, but state discourse suppresses its existence.

Pan Ngai takes us into a Hong Kong-owned electronic factory with 400-500 mainly female employees in Shenzhen Special Economic Zone and she analyses the reasons why some girls leave rural areas for the hardships of factory work and arduous life. Contrary to expectations, the *dagongmei* were not ignorant of life or salaries in these sweatshops prior to their arrival, but were facilitated by kin or ethnic relation in finding work. Two informants are presented to illustrate that these girls were not forced to leave by their families, but by leaving they were consciously challenging their fate of rural family life. These observations are made by criticizing early research on Chinese women's agency in the

typical Chinese patriarchal family, but this chapter would have gained more in terms of explaining decision makings of migration if the author had relied more on international migration theories, e.g. Chinese migration overseas.

The *dagongmei* are often portrayed as China's cheap and docile workforce, but through her intimate ethnographic observations and conversations with the workers Pun Ngai achieves to demonstrate a reality of defiance. Pun Ngai unveils how the migrant workers creatively construct strategies to overcome the inhuman working conditions and assert a little control over the work process by slowdowns at crucial times when the factory needed to keep up with orders or as a protest when factory leadership turned off the radio. Most convincing, however, is her detailed analysis of a tyrannical work regime based on wearing out the workers physically and mentally to transform them into new social bodies.

Pun Ngai also convincingly shows how female workers are disciplined into becoming efficient working subjects not only by harsh working regulations, but by strategies of class, wage and ethnic differentiation as well as by sexualizing the bodies of the *dagongmei*. Social discourse in popular magazines is shown to portray female migrant workers as active sexual subjects, and consumer culture changes female bodies into lustful female subjects. In the factory, the gendering of the workers are described as crucial for disciplining the female workers by ascribing feminine attributes such as submissiveness and tenderness to them or relating high work performance to the female sex. In the factory, Pun Ngai also discusses how the disciplining of becoming a diligent female worker was stressed by different types of uniforms for women and men and not at least by placing men (but also a few women) in managerial and better paid positions. On this basis, the author argues that global capital production also relies heavily on the sexualization of labouring bodies for production purposes in contemporary China.

Finally, the constant fatigue and bodily pain associated with factory life is analysed in terms of the resistant body. Severe menstrual pain aggravated by a toxic environment which made female workers faint were relieved by unnamed pills distributed by the management to regulate the female body to surrender to production, but simultaneously bodies acting on their own behalf against oppression. On this note, the author calls for new ways of perceiving of social class resistance than simply collective political actions.

Through her rich fieldwork at the electronic factory Pun Ngai reaches a deeper understanding of the *dagongmei* than the existing body of studies on urban migration in which an emphasis on macro-level policies have tended to neglect the lives and experiences of the migrants themselves. This makes this book a timely study of contemporary Chinese female worker-subjects in relation to the changing economy of China in the late 1990s. Pun Ngai's contribution provides us with a thoughtful and empathetic analysis setting a new standard for both the value of

ethnographic fieldwork in China as well as proposing new approaches to the study of social class.

METTE THUNØ

Marriage, Gender, and Sex in a Contemporary Chinese Village. By SUN-PONG YUEN, PUI-LAM LAW AND YUK-YING HO. Translated by FONG-YING YU. [Armonk, NY and London: M.E. Sharpe, 2004. 295 pp. ISBN 0-7656-1254-2.]

Marriage, Gender, and Sex in a Contemporary Chinese Village is an expanded English version of *Hunyin, xingbie yu xing: Yige dangdai Zhongguo nongcun de kaocha* (1998), which includes the addition of two substantive new chapters, one extending the overall study by following the lives of the key participants in the research, and the other an examination of the local elections held in 1998, after the earlier research (in 1994–95) had concluded. Both the new chapters add insights and analyses related to the core themes of the earlier research, as well as updates through to early 2002.

This valuable study is located at the intersection of contemporary theory – primarily but not only in critical hermeneutics – and contemporary social changes in the Pearl River Delta, as manifested in one village that has been the site of significant economic growth and flourishing enterprises since the late 1980s and especially in the 1990s. The study is a collaboration between a senior male scholar (Yuen) working in social theory and applied social science and two junior scholars in related fields, one male (Law) and one female (Ho). The gender of the research team is relevant here, since the focus on gender, sexuality and the sex trade in this study has benefited from the multiple positioning in age and gender of the members of the research team. The work is informed by feminist theory and research in the field, and includes engagement and interviews with local and migrant women in homes, factories and karaoke bars, as well as with local men in homes, work and local public places.

The book includes and is framed by a set of three conceptual issues – Chinese familism, women’s liberation, and individual autonomy and consciousness of selfhood. The research explores these theoretically and through examination of lives and narratives of lives in one Pearl River community. The central, substantive chapters of the book are divided into three parts. The first presents narratives of marriage and family from three local men. The second presents a set of narratives from women examining not only marriage and family, but also work and selfhood. The third section examines the development of a rampant sex trade within and near the village. In the 1990s every male villager had some connection with it and/or had other extramarital sexual involvement, and the authors explore the implications of this for marriage, selfhood and family relations for both women and men. The volume’s sensitive and feminist critique of the impact on the lives of men and women is especially strong, and the multi-faceted emphasis on men here is relatively unusual and a notable contribution to the work.

Many of the findings of the study as a whole are consistent with wider ethnographic work carried out in China in the past two decades. This book is distinctive, apart from its contribution regarding the sex trade, in the strength and depth of its analysis of familism as practically expressed in a diversity of lived experiences in this Pearl River community, from everyday family issues through troubled marital circumstances and the processes of corrupting local elections.

In addition to the ethnographic contribution, the volume presents a sustained engagement between some imported social science, notably feminism and Western concepts of individual autonomy, with related Chinese concepts and especially with ideas and practices of familism which form the focus of this book.

Marriage, Gender, and Sex in a Contemporary Chinese Village is a strong contribution meriting the attention of scholars and senior students of China and of gender and sexuality in China and cross-culturally.

ELLEN R. JUDD

Revolution Plus Love: Literary History, Women's Bodies, and Thematic Repetition in 20th-Century Chinese Fiction. By LIU JIANMEI. [Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2003. xii + 272 pp. \$49.00 (hardcover). ISBN 0-8248-2586-1.]

This book is an ambitious project that examines the variations on the theme of "revolution plus love" in a broad range of fictional works from the 1920s to the 1990s. Through an analysis of the changing and at times conflicting fictional representations of the relationship between love and revolution – touching on diverse issues including the tensions between the individual and the collective, nationalism and feminism, politics and commercialism – the author aims to show the paradox and contradictions inherent to intellectual imaginings of Chinese modernity.

The contributions of this book are at least three-fold. Firstly, in addition to analysing more familiar works such as those of women writers in the 1930s and Shanghai New Sensationalist writers, it culls through a rich body of fiction that have received little attention in Western scholarship. These include the works of leftist writers of the 1920s and 1930s (Jiang Guangci, Mao Dun, Hong Lingfei, Hua Han), as well as writers active in the first 17 years after the founding of the CCP (Xiao Yemu, Deng Youmei, Feng Cun, Lu Ling, Ouyang Shan, Yang Mo, Zong Pu). Secondly, it resuscitates revolutionary literature from its usual depiction as mere propaganda by highlighting their heterogeneity and diversity, as well as the inherent contradictions and anxieties embedded within these works. Thirdly, it productively engages theory with close textual analysis and rigorous historical contextualization. The result is a thorough, meticulously researched project that provides a sustained analysis of the

complicated intertwinement of literary praxis and representations with historical, social, and cultural forces of the times.

The author convincingly uses Pierre Bourdieu's concepts of "agents" and "fields" to depict Chinese literature as a field of contestation amongst groups vying for contention and literary legitimacy (p. 36) and Prasenjit Duara's notion of "bifurcated history" to emphasize "the dynamic, multiple, and contested nature of historical identities." (p. 193) However, the author's emphasis on "the formula's variability and volatility, in which the meanings of concepts are open to contest and redefinition and the modes of writing themselves are dynamic and unstable" (p. 213) may gloss over important continuities and commonalities. For example, literary precedents for the strategic politicization of love and desire (by May Fourth intellectuals, or pushing even further back to late Ming intelligentsia) as a means through which writers assert their own political and social status as an intellectual class are only briefly alluded to in the introduction and conclusion. Providing a more in-depth contextualization in this regard may also help accentuate what makes the "revolution plus love" variations in 20th-century fiction particularly "modern," as the author states in her conclusion.

The book raises important questions: What makes for the enduring popularity of the theme of revolution plus love and its endless recycling? What is the relationship between literary praxis and political and social change? What are the inherent tensions and contradictions reflected in the changing depictions of revolution and love? Questions difficult to answer fully given the book's ambitious timeframe and scope, and yet, the author is to be commended for an able job of elucidating the changing parameters of gender and revolution as both a reflection and result of changing political motivations and historical milieus. As a result, and understandably so considering the scope of the book, lesser attention is paid to another very important impetus propelling this thematic repetition: consumer demand and the rapid commercialization of the literary market. Indeed, the author cites many insightful observations in this regard: the paradoxical nature of leftist writers' condemnation of capitalist materialism and their own relationship to the literary market in which their works circulated (p. 55); Shanghai writers' deliberate situation of this theme within a capitalist culture of consumption (p. 156); and in more contemporary times, intellectual anxiety in light of global capitalism (p. 211). All important points worthy of more in-depth analysis, which also might be productively linked.

In light of the book's subtitle, readers expecting a more critical and nuanced engagement with the fictional deployment of women's bodies, however, may be disappointed. Referring to new women figures in Mao Dun's fiction, the author's argument that the "powerful and sexual bodies of these femmes fatales do not carry a perverse meaning but positive and progressive connotations" (p. 107) seems open to debate and may have benefited from more critical comparisons with the new woman figure in May Fourth works and the eroticized female bodies in New Sensationalist fiction, all of which may, to some extent, continue to be informed by

traditional gender discourses. The diseased and feeble bodies that appear in the works of women writers such as Bai Wei and Lu Yin, beautifully depicted in Chapter three, would have also benefited from more subtle analysis and comparisons with the male depictions of potent female bodies. For to read these diseased and sick bodies as mere sites of “resistance” to and subversions of dominant (male) representations of the new woman (note the possible links with depictions of frail female bodies in traditional fiction) may be to simplify the very ambiguous position of women writers and the complex process of negotiation they often had to engage in to articulate their own visions of Chinese modernity.

This solid study is meticulously researched and filled with erudite insights, and should appeal to readers interested in issues of intellectual agency and identity, nationalism and feminism, and revolutionary literature in particular, as well as modern Chinese literature and culture in general.

EILEEN J. CHENG

Leaving the World to Enter the World: Han Shaogong and Chinese Root-Seeking Literature. By MARK LEENHOUTS. [Leiden: CNWS Publications, 2005. 158 pp. ISBN 90-5789-106-9.]

The Chinese literary trend of root-seeking, with its attention to questions of indigenous identity, tradition and modernity, is a rather problematic and scarcely virgin territory for both Chinese writers and scholars of Chinese literature. That said, Mark Leenhouts has succeeded very well indeed in breathing new life into a familiar argument by basing his book on a textual approach.

This approach has many advantages. Firstly, through a close textual study of the work by Han Shaogong – often referred to as the initiator of the root-seeking literary trend – Mark Leenhouts manages to disentangle some of Han’s short stories and novellas from the trap of exclusively political and sociological readings. At times, the textual approach sustains some of the alleged objectives of the work by Han Shaogong, as expounded in his 1985 article “Literary Roots,” while at other times it illuminates the singularity of Han’s work, by way of differentiating it from the main concerns of the root-seeking group.

In the first chapter, Leenhouts gives an overview of the principal debates amongst the root-seeking authors, situating Han Shaogong’s contribution to them, and traces lines of interconnection between various individual writers. In these pages, the group as whole appears almost as a single, living organism. The reader can be stimulated by seeing each individual’s work in context, in tracing patterns of influence and difference. He or she can effortlessly latch onto the way people working in the same literary movement develop techniques or ideas. However, Leenhouts gives us just a taste of what would perhaps merit more extensive investigation, so as to show how this literary network crosses others, and

how it ripples, radiates across disciplines, borders, oceans, and across time.

Laudably, the reader is at the start put on his guard about the claims made for collective creativity: because sometimes the language of movements and groups can look inward, fencing itself off from literary criticism. Indeed, when one looks closely, individual writers can turn out to be strikingly different from one another, escaping the frame of the group. Consequently, while the first chapter shapes the different writers' intellectual propositions into comprehensible patterns, the following three chapters exhort us to look for a literary singularity.

Leenhouts dedicates Chapters two, three and four to separate Han Shaogong's work from the root-seeking literary trend. The study proceeds here from Han Shaogong's literary peculiarities to a reassessment and redefinition of aims and characteristics of root-seeking literature. Throughout these chapters the reader will deal with questions of identity formation: the traditional sense of Chineseness, which has been so closely related to location, is now restructured in a new relationship with the multiple juxtapositions between the traditional and the modern, the native and the foreign, and the local and the external. Place and identity with their diverse connotations and interrelationships have, in recent years, become central to studies related to the rise of localism and nationalism in the midst of a world trend of globalization in the economic, cultural, and political spheres. The conventional way of viewing a place as bound, fixed and unproblematic in its identity has been challenged by the proliferation of viewpoints.

Place for this writer ceases to mean just the physical geographies or locales where events take place; rather, they take on multiple levels of meaning, allowing him to explore, in an intricate way, different aspects and dimensions of cultural symbols, and identity, while depicting a world of tension and expectations.

A most frequent and consistent literary feature detected by Leenhouts in Han Shaogong's short stories and novellas is the relativistic play derived from his employment of pairs of opposites. Language is seen here as a tool to free polysemic plays and semantic contradictions inherent in Chinese culture. Seen from this perspective, Han Shaogong's interest in Chinese linguistics appears to be particularly relevant for an understanding of his attitude towards culture and literary explorations. Leenhouts could have added a chapter on Han Shaogong's literary contribution as chief editor of the literary journal *Tianya*. The journal, which includes texts by non-professional writers and a collection of neologisms, displays various attempts to create a sort of data base, or historical memory, for linguistic and stylistic studies of Chinese language. *Tianya* could therefore be considered as precious resource for any exposition of Han Shaogong's conception of language, literature and culture in general.

In the final chapter, Mark Leenhouts undertakes a comparison between the larger themes in Han Shaogong's work and those of other writers associated with the root-seeking movement (A Cheng, Mo Yan, Zhang

Chengzhi, Jia Pingwa, and others). Informed by Leenhouts' reading of Han Shaogong's work, the reader can now look to the group again, able to recognize similarities and differences in these writers' literary projects.

Leenhouts' brief book on the whole has great merits, patiently disentangling the many complexities of cultural and literary root seeking, while simultaneously, by way of textual analysis, giving fresh emphasis to familiar critical interpretations. Some of the issues presented in this book are perhaps sketched too hastily, but the study still provides very useful reference points for students and scholars of Chinese literature.

COSIMA BRUNO

Modern Mongolia: From Khans to Commissars to Capitalists. By MORRIS ROSSABI. [Berkeley: University of California Press, 2005. xx + 397 pp. \$24.95. ISBN: 0520244192.]

Modern Mongolia is a welcome addition to the literature on post-socialist Mongolia. In it Morris Rossabi gives the first comprehensive overview of the issues confronting Mongolia since the democratic revolution of 1990, the transition to a market economy and in particular the role of international agencies and foreign donors.

The focus of the book is largely, although not exclusively, economic. Drawing upon primary and secondary sources as well as extensive interviews with many of the major figures in Mongolia in the 1990s, Rossabi argues that many of Mongolia's problems can be laid at the feet of the international agencies and donors who insisted on the adoption of a radical free market policy as the price of foreign assistance. The ideological desires of international institutions, such as the International Monetary Fund and the Asian Development Bank, overlapped with the beliefs of some of the democratic protesters, reinforcing their desire to adopt a "shock therapy" approach to the transition from socialism, with the now-predictable results.

The book reviews the chief political and economic developments of the 1990s and early 21st century. After seventy years of Soviet domination, Mongolia underwent a peaceful democratic revolution in 1989–1990. This was followed by the complete collapse of the economy as Soviet subsidies were withdrawn and replaced by foreign aid. The post-socialist period in Mongolia has seen a slow, unsteady movement towards free-market capitalism and a shift to democracy that is more stable and promising than the neighbouring post-Soviet states of Central Asia. Chapters in *Modern Mongolia* are devoted to a variety of topics, including the impact the transition has had on herders as well as cultural institutions. A chapter is devoted to Sino-Mongolian relations, which is a welcome addition, given China's importance to Mongolia on multiple levels: economic, security and as a source of fear and suspicion. *Modern Mongolia* is also well documented. Of the 397 pages that make up the

volume, only 251 are devoted to the main text. The rest is taken up by footnotes, references and the index.

Although many of these challenges faced by Mongolia have been reported before, *Modern Mongolia* offers an extended review of the situation and couples it with a sustained critique of international development policy. The book will probably be of most interest to non-specialists, as anyone who has followed Mongolia over the past decade and a half will be familiar with most of what Rossabi covers. Even the specialist, however, will want to have a copy as Rossabi saves them the work of having to piece together various happenings (such as the banking scandal of the late 1990s) from newspapers and other accounts.

There are, as in any work, errors of both commission and omission. A few illustrations are in order. Despite the power of the image of protesters outside the government building on 10 December 1989, during the first public protest (p. 2), this is inaccurate. The first public demonstrations took place several blocks away at a site not visible from the government building, as photographs and Mongolian sources make clear. In other cases, facts are technically accurate, but threaten to mislead the reader since they are not sufficiently contextualized. The Mongolian People's Revolutionary Party (MPRP) did indeed win "an impressive victory" in the 2000 election, taking 72 out of the 76 seats (p. 96). But the popular vote was much closer than the official results indicate, with the MPRP winning districts with as little as one quarter to one third of the popular vote. Many people still supported the non-MPRP parties, but Mongolian politics are driven as much, if not more so, by personality as by policy. As a result, numerous candidates often ran against the MPRP in any given district, leaving the highly disciplined MPRP to exploit the disorganization and voters' discontent. The distinction between free market advocates and "democratic reformers" (those portrayed by Rossabi as interested more in social welfare than free-market capitalism) is at times too sharply drawn. Oyun, a "democratic reformer" often quoted by Rossabi as a critic of the current situation, has also called for policies friendlier to investment as well as lower tax rates.

While the democratic parties and coalitions are often blamed for their failings, the MPRP comes in for less criticism. Rossabi (rightly) castigates the Democratic Coalition for its dismissal of many officials and functionaries after winning the 1996 elections. No mention is made, however, of the more extensive purges undertaken by the MPRP after its 2000 victory, or a number of other moves undertaken shortly after it returned to power, including simply ignoring a Constitutional Court ruling against it.

I do wish Rossabi had explored possible alternatives to the road Mongolia followed. He ably points out many of the mistakes and missed opportunities to provide a better social support network for vulnerable groups. I largely agree with him on these assessments, but I wonder how he feels the socialist-era benefits could have been preserved when they were largely made possible only by a command economy heavily subsidized by the Soviet Union. The obvious answer of simply replacing lost

funds with those from the donor community would not solve the issue in the long-term, and would only leave Mongolia more beholden to foreign interests than it already is. Things should have been done differently, Rossabi reiterates, but I am left wondering what his vision is.

In spite of these critiques, this is a useful book. There is nothing similar to *Modern Mongolia* currently available, and the work provides a valuable overview not only of the challenges confronting Mongolians today, but also of the dangers inherent in the system of international aid and development agencies. In the end, though, perhaps the final say should be given to the Mongolian people themselves. Despite the at times rather bleak picture Rossabi paints, opinion poll after opinion poll (as well as many conversations I have had over the years) show that whatever their reservations about the current state of the economy or the government, the majority of Mongolians still believe in the post-socialist project.

CHRISTOPHER KAPLONSKI

A Tibetan Revolutionary: The Political Life and Times of Bapa Phuntso Wangye. By MELVYN C. GOLDSTEIN, DAWEI SHERAP and WILLIAM R. SIBENSCHUH. [Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004. 378 pp. \$24.95. 0-520-24089-8].

Until Melvyn Goldstein, Dawei Sherap and William R. Sibenschuh produced this remarkable biography of Bapa Phuntso Wangye (Phunwang), their subject was best known internationally, outside the circle of Tibet specialists, for using philosophical principles to conclude what was later confirmed by more conventional means – that there is water on the moon. Anyone who visited Phunwang in Beijing after the mid-1990s, when he produced his 200,000-character thesis, was bound to hear about that topic.

Now that his biography is out, those who do not read it will likely hear about Phunwang through comments made to C. Goldstein in a 2002 epilogue to a life story that ends in the 1980s. Phunwang says the Dalai Lama is sincere, selfless and the key to settling the Tibet Question. This view repays compliments about Phunwang by the Dalai Lama in his own autobiography, but also echoes the position of liberal-minded Han Chinese writer Wang Lixiong. The author of *Tian Zang: Xizang de mingyun* (Sky Burial: the Fate of Tibet) (1998), a work that moves discussion of the Tibet Question beyond its usual binaries, Wang penned in 2000 an essay entitled “The Dalai Lama is the Key to the Tibet Problem.” Since then, the Dalai Lama’s supporters outside China have emphasized that point. Phunwang is perhaps the only Tibetan inside China who could publicly agree, if only in a book to be published in English.

While it is interesting that Phunwang could speak positively about the Dalai Lama without retribution, it is his life narrative that is compelling. It provides a window on how the Communist movement and Party rule

played out in his native eastern Tibetan area of Kham in the 1930s and 1940s, in Lhasa in the 1950s, and in interaction between Tibetans and Chinese Communist Party (CCP) leaders in Beijing after 1949. Through family connections, Phunwang enrolled in 1936, at age 14, as a cadet in the Nanjing military academy of Chiang Kai-shek's Kuomintang (KMT). Before his expulsion four years later for organizing against Han chauvinism and mistreatment of Tibetans by the KMT in Kham, he became a Marxist. Phunwang hoped Tibet would become independent and linked to the Soviet Union, with ties to China if it were to have a successful revolution. At a time when few Tibetan leaders in Lhasa or Kham thought of a nation that encompassed all Tibetan-inhabited areas, Phunwang recognized that there was as yet no common Tibetan identity and advanced the idea of unifying the Tibetan areas, while also seeking a social revolution.

Phunwang's viewpoint on the unification of Tibetan territories gave rise to some incongruities, such as when he befriended a prominent Kham aristocrat who, from experience with both, argued that the Chinese Communists who passed through the area on the Long March treated the population well, while troops from the Lhasa government that entered Kham oppressed local Tibetans. When Phunwang crossed over to the Lhasa government's territory, he found people there to be much poorer and oppressed by aristocrats, officials and soldiers. It is that experience that probably accounts for his remaining a Marxist, rather than a nationalist *tout court*.

Travelling to Lhasa in the hope of initiating revolution, Phunwang concluded that the traditional system of aristocrats, estates and an abundance of monks harmed Tibet. While he made many contacts among aristocrats, he was forced to leave in 1949, when the Lhasa government expelled the Han and any Tibetans they suspected of being Communists. Returning to Kham, not long before the People's Liberation Army (PLA) arrived, he served as a county CCP secretary and advisor to Deng Xiaoping and other leaders of the 18th Army planning to enter central Tibet. Efforts to persuade the Lhasa government to negotiate were unsuccessful and the PLA confronted and decisively defeated a Tibetan army of 10,000 troops.

Phunwang was intimately involved in the negotiations that then did take place. The result was the famous 17-Point Agreement on the Peaceful Liberation of Tibet, under which continued rule by the existing government of Tibet was promised. Phunwang, who believed that there was no alternative to the agreement, gives no hint that the agreement was predicated on personal coercion of the negotiators or trickery, although he notes that the Tibetans were told that if they did not agree to the PLA's peaceful entry into Tibet, the troops would come anyway.

Phunwang accompanied the army to Lhasa in 1951 and served as a member of the Tibet Work Committee. Some aristocrats co-operated with him, but others were hostile. Phunwang was convinced that the CCP and Dalai Lama could co-exist if the most hard-line aristocrats were removed

from government. The Dalai Lama agreed and “progressive” aristocrats helped Phunwang establish a public school and a youth association. At the same time, he witnessed some displays of Han chauvinism during quarrels over minor matters between PLA men and local Tibetans and came to believe that too many CCP officials had a top-down approach to reforming Tibetan society.

Phunwang served as the Dalai Lama’s translator when the latter visited Mao in 1954. He was pleased that Mao offered to allow Tibetans to have their own national flag and to recall from Tibet any official who the Dalai Lama found objectionable, while Premier Zhou Enlai urged the Dalai Lama not to engage in reform precipitously. Phunwang was delighted that Vice-Premier Chen Yi, who visited Lhasa the following year, said that Han in Tibet should learn from Tibetans about Tibet’s situation and that Lhasa should be the capital of a Tibet that included all Tibetan areas.

In 1958, Phunwang was accused of “local nationalism” (*difang minzu zhuyi*), in part based on misunderstandings of some rather unimportant statements he made in the past and in part because a nationwide anti-local nationalism campaign had just been waged. The subsequent Anti-Rightist Campaign and the uprising in Lhasa in 1959 worsened Phunwang’s predicament. Imprisoned in 1960, he was to spend the next 15 years in solitary confinement and three years in a mental hospital. After his release, he received a government apology and played a role in contacts between the PRC government and Tibetan exiles. Phunwang continued to urge the state to consider the exiles’ demands for a unification of all Tibetan areas, which he said would allow them to abandon the goal of an independent Tibet.

After CCP head Hu Yaobang visited Tibet in 1980, he offered to make Phunwang governor of Tibet and later appoint a Tibetan (who might well be Phunwang) as Party leader there. That was not to be, as a couple years later Phunwang was embroiled in a controversy about liberalizing the PRC constitution’s “nationalities clauses.” He eventually prevailed and worked until 1993 as deputy director of the Nationalities Committee of the National People’s Congress, but did not return to lead Tibet. Phunwang continued to regard himself as a Marxist (as does the Dalai Lama at times!) and to advocate expanded autonomy for Tibet, a reduction of Han migration to Tibet’s cities, and greater efforts to protect Tibetan culture. He also continued to get a hearing for his views from top CCP leaders.

Some might find this work, which was carefully constructed from hundreds of hours of interviews with Phunwang, to be about the tragedy of both his life and Tibet. It is unlikely he would do so. Rather, several passages indicate that he thinks positively of many changes in Tibet over the past half-century and regards himself as an historical and contemporary link between the CCP and Tibetan nationalists, a role the Dalai Lama seems to appreciate. His biography is a contribution not only to our understanding of key events in the transformation of Tibet, but also to

constructing areas of agreement that may facilitate the resolution of the Tibet Question.

BARRY SAUTMAN

State Growth and Social Exclusion in Tibet. By ANDREW MARTIN FISCHER. [Copenhagen, NIAS Press (Nordic Institute of Asian Studies), 2005. 213 pp. £14.99. ISBN: 8791114632.]

When Wang Xiaoqiang and Bai Nanfeng examined the Tibetan economy of the 1980s in *The Poverty of Plenty* (1991), they noted the dependence of Tibet on “blood transfusions,” massive subsidies to the state sector that consume more wealth than they generate, while bypassing the rural sector where most Tibetans reside. Andrew Fischer’s timely analysis of the current phase of economic development in *State Growth and Social Exclusion in Tibet* suggests that, in many ways, nothing has changed. He examines the consequences for Tibet of the spending and investment in China’s western regions that began in the mid-1990s, and accelerated after 2000. Economic growth in the Tibet Autonomous Region (TAR) continues to depend on subsidies that come directly from the central government, contributing largely to the economy of urban areas, and consisting mainly of construction projects and the salaries of state employees. Twenty years ago, Wang and Bai expressed the hope that an influx of Han migrants would overcome what they perceived to be the “backwardness” of Tibetan society. Fischer’s argument is that modern economic development itself is responsible for the exclusion and marginalization of the Tibetan population. He avoids attributing a sinister design to Chinese policies, emphasizing instead the common problems that Tibet shares with other poor developing regions throughout the world. This book will interest not only China and Tibet specialists, but also development economists and others working in international development.

Fischer relies exclusively on an analysis of official Chinese economic statistics published in the national and provincial statistical yearbooks (compiled by the National Bureau of Statistics and its provincial counterparts in Qinghai and the TAR). This data is generally regarded as inflated or sometimes even fabricated. Fischer is aware of its deficiencies, but chooses to use the data as reported, rather than attempt to correct or supplement it. His position is that “there are certain developmental dynamics that are self-evident from the ground and which are reflected in broad comparisons of the official data, even if the accuracy of each number is dubious” (p. 8). For example, the recession in the TAR throughout the first half of the 1990s becomes evident when the official GDP data is indexed for inflation. These results are quite straightforward, and the official data does not conceal them. As he explains, his aim is to use the statistical data as “heuristic interpretive devices” (p. 11) to discern the overall structure of development.

The TAR has among the highest urban incomes in the country. This is largely because of the weight of the state sector in urban incomes. State-sector salaries have always been high in the TAR, but they jumped from 50% above the national average in 1998 to 80% above in 2001. And the beneficiaries of these high wages have been mainly Tibetans (in 1999 over 70% of staff and workers in state-owned units were Tibetans). This dramatic increase in incomes has produced an “emerging Tibetan middle class,” whose disposable income has fuelled the boom in retail consumption visible in cities like Lhasa. In the meantime, rural incomes have stagnated, while increasing population pressure in the countryside has forced rural Tibetans to migrate in search of work. But “expansion in the secondary and tertiary sectors in Tibetan areas, has tended, at least in part, to be absorbed by immigrating labour, both skilled and unskilled, rather than by migrating rural labour or the urban poor” (p. 132). As Fischer stresses, it is not a question of Tibetans being swamped by waves of Han migration, but rather the “crowding out effect that such in-migration creates in the local economy, particularly at a stage when urban opportunities are so critical for the urbanising rural Tibetans” (p. 132).

The level of state subsidy has to constantly increase in order to maintain GDP growth. In Fischer’s words, this produces a form of “fiscal grotesqueness that is aimed at overriding an outflow that was produced by the very structural and economic character of Chinese economic rule in the first place” (p. 83). Massive construction projects, such as the Qinghai-Tibet railway, are contracted to out-of-province companies and employment goes to outsiders with skills, while the money from the central government to finance these projects returns inland. The alternative is a collapse of the boom economy that those subsidies generate.

Fischer does not believe that restricting immigration is an option. But current policies produce a “very specific migration scenario in the urban areas, wherein migrants possess an overwhelming competitive superiority over locals, thus producing exclusion among locals” (p. 151). This situation will not be reversed without affirmative action that supports local Tibetan workers and businesses, and builds local expertise and capital. That was the intention of the reform policies announced by Hu Yao Bang in 1980, which were never adequately implemented. As Fischer notes, the call to “Tibetanise” economic development has a long history. In fact, similar policies have been implemented for the marginalized populations and peripheral regions of developed countries. They also underlie many of the projects undertaken in Tibet by local and international development organizations. Fischer’s contribution in this study is to show how resistance to these more appropriate models of development is rooted in deeply entrenched structural features of the Tibetan economy rather than wilful neglect or persecution.

RONALD SCHWARTZ

Uyghur Education and Social Order: The Role of Islamic Leadership in the Turpan Basin. By JIANXIN WANG. [Studia Culturae Islamicae, No. 76. Tokyo: Research Institute for Languages and Cultures of Asia and Africa, Tokyo University of Foreign Studies, 2004. ISBN: 4-87297-865-X.]

Jianxin Wang's innovative and insightful study of Islamic education and practice in the Turpan region of Xinjiang significantly expands the limited range of ethnographic studies of Central Asian Islam that have appeared to date. Ethnographic studies of Islam are very limited in the ex-Soviet Union and in Chinese Central Asia, largely because of political limits on research. Wang makes important contributions to the study of both Muslim elites and social organization in the Turpan region. Well versed in the ethnographic literature on Islamic learning and leadership, Wang focuses on the study of authority, knowledge transmission, and the socio-political roles of Muslim and more secular elites, as developed in the works of Clifford Geertz, Ernest Gellner, Dale Eickelman and Richard Antoun elsewhere in the Islamic world. Wang's work contrasts with that of these precursors in that he finds differing sources of authority, attends to more incidental and informal educational activities, and exposes the complex and shifting relation of Islamic authorities to Chinese rule.

During a total of 20 months of fieldwork, focusing on two village communities in the Turpan Basin region, Wang was able to establish close working relationships with a number of Muslim leaders. One imam in particular, Ismayil Qarahaji, became a key supporter of Wang's work and facilitated his participation in local Islamic activities despite the fact that Wang is not Muslim. As a result, Ismayil becomes a dominant source for Wang's historical background and interpretations of Islam. Although Ismayil Qarahaji is an important presence throughout this study, Wang's long fieldwork, wide social acceptance and Uyghur language skills give him access to a wide range of political, religious, social and healing events. The obvious question of whether Uyghurs perceived Wang as a potential source of political problems is not raised, but he seems not to see, or chooses not to report on, any overtly anti-Han attitudes.

Wang's ethnographic acumen leads to valuable in-depth analysis of the ways clerics negotiate a careful balance between what he terms their *qayda* (customary) and *qanun* (official, legal) activities. While in the informal authority structure of the Uyghur Muslim community the clerics are highly respected, they also have to participate in the official Chinese system of political control where they have a more ambiguous status. He argues that in the former role they exercise social control and leadership through the symbolic persuasive powers they draw upon in sermons, didactic poetry and other ritual activities, while in the official political sphere they earn local respect by maintaining some critical perspective on government activities, without violating their legal obligations to nominally support government authority and its decisions.

Perhaps because he was not privy to more openly expressed opposition to the Chinese state or because he is working with people who work within the “multi-layered system of religious administration” through which local government controls Islamic education and religious affairs (p. 149), Wang attends primarily to clerics’ more subtle resistance and negotiation of power in a multitude of local situations. Based in extensive documentary research and interviews, Wang describes clerics’ experiences of Islamic education during the Republican period, and their shifting fortunes under PRC rule. They are not shy about criticizing government policies and some are even willing to describe the ways they personally undermine official projects or galvanize dissent when they feel it is justified.

Wang’s careful ethnographic work appears also in his wide-ranging economic and social data and details of village physical and social organization. Although common in community studies in other areas of China, his presentation of such information provides a depth unusual in studies of Central Asian Islam. Wang is particularly successful when he follows up ethnographic opportunities and integrates his findings into a thorough portrayal of the more orthodox, institutionally trained and officially approved Islamic leaders within their historical, political and social conditions.

Had more effort been put into peer review and editorial supervision of this volume it would certainly become a widely read and valuable study in this neglected field. Unfortunately, despite its accessible style, a number of problems will restrict its value to specialists whose existing knowledge will help them overcome the poor English and occasionally biased analyses. Wang limits his cultural analyses by allowing his strong rapport with the Muslim clerics to lead him to accept their criticisms of lay Muslim practices. Wang details the clerics’ comments on Uyghur popular Islam and describes practices such as mazar visits, healing and magic, but his dismissive attitude prevents him from more fully exploring practitioners’ stances towards these activities. A more careful analysis of the sources on this topic would help us understand how clerics’ attitudes towards popular practices have changed and why: at present we cannot say whether their criticisms are part of a long-standing but ineffective effort to move people away from practices seen as heterodox, or are part of more recent efforts to strengthen Islamic orthodoxy and clerical authority.

Ideally, studies such as Wang’s would help overcome Beijing’s fear of Islam as a supposed stimulant to political activism. If Wang’s observations are valid, Uyghur Muslims at mosques and mazars are far more concerned to promote their rights to practice Islam and ameliorate strict local government controls than with seeking radical political change.

Along with the works of Ildikó Beller-Hann (“Solidarity and contest among Uyghur healers in Kazakhstan.” *Inner Asia* 3 (2001), pp. 73–98; “‘Making the oil fragrant.’ Dealings with the supernatural among the Uighur in Xinjiang.” *Asian Ethnicity* 2:1 (2001) pp. 9–23.) and Rahilä Dawut on popular religious and healing practices (*Uyghur Mazarläri*.

Ürümchi: Shinjang Khälq Näshriyati, 2001), this volume will be required reading for anyone interested in Uyghur Islam.

NATHAN LIGHT

A Newspaper for China? Power, Identity, and Change in Shanghai's News Media, 1872–1912. By BARBARA MITTLER. [Harvard East Asian Monographies 226, Harvard University Asia Center. Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 2004. xvi + 504 pp. ISBN 0-674-01217-8.]

Here is another study of Shanghai's early modern press. It focuses on the *Shenbao*, a privately-owned newspaper, founded in the International Settlement by British merchant, Ernest Major. The research is devoted to the first decades (1872–1912) of the history of this long-lived publication. Compared with previous studies which described the institutional development of the newspaper and its relationships with the historical context, Barbara Mittler's approach is original, the main topic of her research being the text itself. The author's aim is to decipher the significance of the "rhetorical practices of journalism in the late Qing," and evaluate its power of persuasion.

This research was conducted between 1994 and 1997 at the University of Heidelberg. It is benefited by the collective endeavour, led by Professor Rudolf Wagner, to study the "Development of a Chinese public sphere," in co-operation with other German scholars and some members of the Shanghai Academy of Social Sciences. Several years elapsed between the start and end of the research in the final revision of the manuscript and its publication in 2004. In spite of the author's effort to integrate the most recent literature on Shanghai's history into her revised manuscript, her bibliography appears slightly outdated, as does her emphasis on concepts no longer prevailing in the Chinese public sphere and emergence of a civil society.

In this reviewer's view, the most impressive and valuable contribution of the book is to be found in its first part, "Creating the medium." The author shows how the Western-style newspaper went native to please its audience (particularly Chinese literati) and increase its sales. Although the *Shenbao* was owned by a foreigner, it was in the hands of Chinese editors who acknowledged the Western press as a model but thought they had to package the *Shenbao* in "culturally acceptable forms." The *Shenbao* was thus published as small folded booklets, printed on thin bamboo pulp paper. Like the court gazette (*Jingbao*), it used honorary spaces before the name of the Chinese emperor. Many of its editorials were written according to the stylistic rules of the eight-legged essays (*baguwen*) and took for models the rhetoric of classical pieces such as *lun*, *shuo*, *ji* or *shu*. They were written in a very polished style, which made it easier for their authors to introduce new ideas to their audience. Chinese editorialists also used many quotations from the Classics, the meaning of which they often subverted by omissions and various

manipulations, using them as “familiar wrappings for unfamiliar ideas” (p. 109). The reprinting of the court gazette was another way of pursuing the sinicization of the alien medium. But this inclusion of the *Jingbao* into a newspaper in which it was treated just like another item and eventually discussed and criticized, led to the recontextualization of the official gazette and made “the Chinese State to go public” (Chapter three).

These developments, which take up half of the book (242 pages), are informed by a thorough reading of the *Shenbao* (not an easy reading!) and very precise references to various pieces of classical rhetoric. Patterns emerge from rigorous, literal comparisons. Textual analysis may sometimes seem very detailed (more exercises for a research seminar than providers of arguments in the chain of reasoning), long and numerous footnotes may encroach upon the main text, this is nonetheless erudition at its best. The idea that modernization is brought about by cultural shifts, compromises and hybridization, rather than by brutal changes and fractures, is not a new one, but Mittler’s study presents a bright and convincing illustration of this thesis, applied to the birth of modern newspapers in China.

In the second half of the book, the author analyses the construction of the reading public – female readers and Shanghaians (*Shanghaiens*) – and tries to evaluate the potential influence of the *Shenbao* on its audience. For so doing, she resorts to the juxtaposition of the medium content (advertisements, editorials, news reports) and historical realities. But the *Shenbao* voices are discordant and its descriptions and prescriptions are ambiguous and contradictory. “The confusing wealth of incongruent and overlapping arguments” (p. 340) found in the *Shenbao* articles are reflected in Mittler’s developments. Rooted in the texts, the analysis is drawn into complex meanders. On the other hand, “historical realities” are not as firmly grasped as textual analysis. This is specially so in the last chapter, “The nature of Chinese Nationalism revisited.” Specific comments of precise events are appraised as general statements of intent: for example, the hesitations with which the news of the October 1911 Wuchang uprising is received by the newspaper are understood as the expressions of a counter-revolutionary stance, an interpretation which ignores the uncertainties and doubts which surrounded the first phase of the 1911 Revolution even in the minds of the Tongmenghui leaders. Other instances of this approximation of “historical realities” may be found in the assimilation between the Manchu dynasty and the Chinese “self” during the last decade of the Qing dynasty (p. 399), or in the systematic confusion between xenophobia and patriotism (p. 363). The general conclusion drawn from these shaky pieces of evidence (emphasizing the weak, mostly imagined power of the press in modern China) does not seem as convincing as the analysis of the sinicization of the *Shenbao*, which will remain a model of textual analysis and will appeal to China specialists already familiar with ancient and modern Chinese culture.

MARIE-CLAIRE BERGÈRE

China Marches West: The Qing Conquest of Central Eurasia. By PETER C. PERDUE. [Cambridge, MA and London: Harvard University Press. xx + 752 pp. £22.95. ISBN 0-674-01684-X.]

This book is magisterial in content and beautifully produced (under the Belknap Press imprint), demonstrating on its own that it is still worthwhile to print books on paper and between covers. Perdue's researches of the past nine years on the logistics, strategies, and cultural representations of the conquests of Zungharia and Eastern Turkestan are joined in a master narrative of the late 17th through 19th centuries. They are further integrated with standing and emerging interpretations of the ecology, sociology, economy and semiology of conquest in Central Asia, providing a truly definitive study of regional expansion in the mid-Qing in the framework of the larger political and cultural passages of the entire Qing period.

Aided by superb maps, Perdue constructs the backdrop of Qing-Russian competition in Inner and Central Asia in the 15th and 16th centuries and the coalescence and disintegration of Zunghar power before, roughly, 1710. His narrative of this history is the clearest and most vivid, yet available in English tract on the careers of Galdan and Tsewang Araptan. Chapters 3 and 4, which detail the Qing conquest and occupation of western Mongolia and Eastern Turkestan, are the heart of the book. Drawing on his original research, Perdue is able to reconstruct the complex process of invasion, supply, management and attempted absorption with both detail and economy, providing a superbly focused and convincing examination of a long-term Qing mobilization. The scholarly depth and perceptive timbre of the book are greatly aided by Perdue's familiarity with Manchu sources and with scholarship in Russian. In two appendices, Perdue shares translations of original documents pertaining to the Yongzheng emperor's responses to the news of the loss of 80 per cent of a Qing expeditionary force after a Zunghar ambush near Khobdo in July 1731, and incidental reports of the antics of traders and Qing officials in the market towns of newly-occupied Xinjiang. The passages are acutely chosen and complement the spirit of the larger narrative.

This very virtuous book exhibits a few behaviours that will perplex those sharing research interests in its topics. Some are reflected in the title of the book: Whether or not a reader will agree that "China" (as contrasted to the Qing empire) is marching west is a question, as is whether the place being reached is "Central Eurasia" (which to some readers will mean Afghanistan, Tajikistan, Kazakhstan and environs) as contrasted to "Central Asia." More worrying, the summaries and assessments of standing interpretations that dominate the first and last thirds of the book may strike some readers as breezy and sententious, while others more intimately connected with the central story may appear predicated on unfairly flattened renditions of other scholars' work. The once-current but never wholly convincing notion of a "California School" of economic development interpretation is invoked but found oversimplified, as Perdue prefers his "European similarity thesis." An "Altaic school," is also

conjured, enrolling a clump of scholars who actually have widely varying and contradictory opinions on the Altaic construct (I am seconded by Perdue to the Altaic school though I clearly do not find any Altaic constructs persuasive apart from some of the strictly linguistic ones). This alleged “Altaic school” is then assigned certain opinions on “Manchu” characteristics of the Qing which appear to reflect some of their actual views but not all (none of mine, certainly). Characterizations of individual work are also often abridged until unrecognizable, then faulted for being too simplistic. I would comment on two examples: Millward never claimed that Qing commercial and administrative policies in Xinjiang were entirely *de novo*; rather, in *Beyond the Pass*, he argued that Qing policies displayed previously unappreciated flexibility, innovation and tolerance for extemporaneity. This reviewer never claimed that the Yongzheng emperor’s arguments in *Dayi juemi lu* were premised on any assumption that Manchus had been civilized only after the conquest of China, or that essentialist ideas entered Qing imperial discourse only in the Qianlong period; rather, in *A Translucent Mirror*, the process by which essentialist identity constructs evolved is traced from the Hong Taiji through the Qianlong periods.

Such passages contrast with others in which Perdue’s handling of historiographic issues is more nuanced. In the end, those who find themselves baffled by the renditions here of existing scholarship are free to read the cited studies for themselves in all their complexity. What none of us is free to do is fail to read Perdue’s own contribution. It provides enlightening reading for specialists, and many valuable narrative passages and visual aids for readers new to the field.

PAMELA KYLE CROSSLEY

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.